Current Progress with NAMs in Next **Generation Risk Assessment (NGRA)** and opportunities in chemical registration

Carl Westmoreland





Unilever's Safety & Environmental Assurance Centre (SEAC) Our purpose: to protect people & the environment

Around the world, 3.4 billion people use a Unilever product every day. **We want our consumers to be confident that our products are safe**.

In collaboration with our partners, SEAC scientists help ensure **Unilever's innovations are safe & sustainable without animal testing**.

We engage with all stakeholders to build shared understanding and promote trust in **our** scientific evidence-based approach to decision-making.











All Unilever products must be safe for humans and the environment





Assuring safety without animal testing: Maximising use of existing information and non-animal approaches

EXPOSURE

• All risk assessments start by understanding levels of consumer exposure

INGREDIENT-SPECIFIC BIOACTIVITY DATA

- Use all available safety data on the ingredient
 - Clinical, epidemiological, animal (if dates permit), in vitro etc
- Exposure-based waiving approaches (e.g. Threshold of Toxicological Concern, TTC)
- in silico predictions
- History of safe use
- Read across
- Use of existing OECD in vitro approaches
- Next Generation Risk Assessment (NGRA)







The history of bans on animal testing for cosmetic products and ingredients in the EU

>10 years of assuring safety without animal testing

CONNECTING THE DOTS FOR ANIMALS: HISTORY OF THE EU BAN ON ANIMAL TESTING FOR COSMETICS





Source: https://ec.europa.eu/growth/sectors/cosmetics/ban-animal-testing_en



What is next generation risk assessment (NGRA)?



What is next generation risk assessment (NGRA)?

"An exposure-led, hypothesis driven risk assessment approach that incorporates one or more NAMs to ensure that chemical exposures do not cause harm to consumers"

Dent et al ., (2018) Comp Tox 7:20-26



NAM = New Approach Methodology

Why is NGRA important? The Systemic Challenge



A new non-animal paradigm is needed...



...but replacement of animal test data is not the answer

Tiered, exposure-led NGRA means we can make robust safety decisions

 Increasing recognition that *in vitro* bioactivity can inform decision making (e.g. Health Canada, EU SCCS)

	Computational Toxicology 7 (2018) 20-26
24780128384	Contents lists available at ScienceDirect
211111	Commutational Tanialam
e She	Computational Toxicology
ELSEVIER	journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/comtox
Principles und of cosmetic in	erpinning the use of new methodologies in the risk assessment
Matthew Dent ^{a,*} , F Masato Hatao ^e , Ak Beta Montemayor ¹ Rajeshwar Verma ^j	- centat Tcixeira Amaral ⁹ , Pedro Amores Da Silva ⁹ , Jay Ansell ⁷ , Fanny Boisleve ⁴ , ihiko Hirose ⁶ , Yutaka Kasai ⁷ , Petra Kern ³ , Reinhard Kreiling ⁴ , Stanley Milstein ⁴ , Julcemara Oliveira ¹ , Andrea Richarz ⁻⁷ , Rob Taalman ² , Eric Vaillancourt [*] , Nashira Vieira Orkelliv Cabral Dosada ¹ , Craig Weiss ² , Haime Kolima ⁴
** AMUPPEL - Association of the ** US Personal Care Products Co ** Johnson & Johnson Santé Bea ** Japan Cosmetic Industry Acos ** National Institute of Headth Sc ** Kao Corporation, External Ref ** Procter and Gamble Services O ** Clarinae Produktic (DI) Gabil ** US Frood and Drug Administrum Collares took MD 20206-1276.	Control, Carrollo, Carrollo, Carrollo, Carrollo, Carrollo, Carrollo, Carrollo, Pauli, M 2011 Old, Bual Carrollo, Santo Carrollo, Carrollo, Carrollo, Santo Carrollo, Santo Carrollo, Santo Carrollo, Santo Santo Child, Marco Carrollo, Carrollo, Santo Santo Santo Carrollo, Santo Santo Santo Child, Marco Carrollo, Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Child, Santo Carrollo, Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Child, Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Child, Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Santo Children, Santo
Course Pare, MD 20/40, USA ⁶ Cosmetics Alliance Canada, 4, ¹ Browline Health Resolutions Au	20 Britannia Road East Suite 102, Mexissaggi, ON 1/27 315, Canada www.(ANDSA). Generatio de Brochster de Baiene Berlanne Compléteur e Sensenter SIA Trache 5. Inte 200, Ann Baucial 57 (BP)
71205-050, Brazil ^{III} European Commission, Joint I	Research Centre (JRC), Directorate for Health, Consumers and Reference Materials, Chemical Safety and Atternative Methods Unit, Via E.
Fermi 2749, 21027 Igro, VA, 1 ¹⁰ Cosmetics Europe, Avenue Her ¹⁰ Health Conada (HC), Consum ¹⁰ Independent Cosmetic Manufo	wiy Denne 40, 1140 Anderglen, Register in Product Sofery Decements, Enably Environments and Consumer Sofery Dennek, 200 Laurier Are, W., Ottanen, ON KIA 600, Canada analy and Garabanan (ECMAD), 21925 Public Parkings, State 2015, Daer Park, IL 60010, USA
	A B S T R A C T





International Cooperation on Cosmetics Regulation (2018) European Commission: Scientific Committee on Consumer Safety (2021, 2023)



Key tools in our NGRA approaches for Systemic Toxicity: Exposure and Bioactivity (First Tier Tools)





Cellular Stress Pathways

13 chemicals, 36 Biomarkers; 3 Timepoints; 8 Concentrations; ~10 Stress Pathways





(11)

Point of Departure (POD)





Points of Departure (PODs) from NAMs can be protective







Bioactivity: Exposure Ratio (BER)

POD from *in vitro* Bioactivity Assays

Systemic exposure in humans (from PBK)

'Bioactivity exposure ratios (BERs). BERs are analogous to the traditional margin of exposure used in risk assessment in that chemicals with a lower BER possess a higher potential for risk'

Kuo et al (2022)



<u>Science approach document - Bioactivity exposure</u> <u>ratio: Application in priority setting and risk</u> <u>assessment - Canada.ca</u>



Benchmarking to determine a low-risk BER



Yellow dots: high risk benchmarks Blue dots: low risk benchmarks

Middleton et al., (2022) Toxicol Sci, 189, 124-147

Beyond consumer safety: Chemicals Regulations NGRA for worker safety

- Understanding worker exposure
 - Different routes of exposure
 - Levels of exposure
 - Engineering controls
 - Use of personal protective equipment
- NGRA
 - BER approach for worker exposure





Conclusions

- The Next Generation Risk Assessment (NGRA) toolbox is increasingly being used as part of decisions on consumer safety that do not involve animal testing
- NGRA and the use of NAMs (New Approach Methodologies) is being mentioned in some regulatory guidelines
- Working on examples of decision-making using NGRA is one of the best ways to build familiarity and confidence with the tools e.g. Baltazar *et al* (2020), *Toxicol Sci*, **176**, 236-252
- There is still work to do e.g. working on a framework for establishing scientific confidence in new approach methodologies (van der Zalm *et al, Archives of Toxicology*, **96**, 2865-2879)



(17)





The European Partnership for Alternative Approaches to Animal Testing

Advancing

Advancing Public Health and Animal Welfare



Acknowledgements

- Adam Wood
- Alex Teixeira
- Alistair Middleton
- Andrea Gredelj
- Andrew White
- Anthony Bowden
- Annabel Rigarlsford
- Ashraf Abdelkhaliq
- Beate Nicol
- Catherine Barratt
- Chris Sparham
- Chrissie Langley
- Clarissa Donna
- Claudia Rivetti
- Danilo Basili
- Dawei Tang
- Elin Barrett

Unilever

Ellen Edwards

- Erica Vit
- Fazila Bunglawala
- Gavin Maxwell
- Geoff Hodges
 - Georgia Reynolds
- Gopal Pawar
- Gordon Riley
- Hequn Li

•

- Hugh Barlow
- Ian Malcomber
- Iris Muller
- Jade Houghton
- Jayne Roberts
- Jin Li
- Joe Reynolds
- Julia Fentem
- Juliet Hodges
- Karen Boness

- Katie Przybylak
- Katy Wolton
- Lisa Ryder
- Lucy Bull
- Magda Sawicka
- Maria Baltazar
- Maja Aleksic
- Matt Dent
- Nathan Kenyon
- Nicola Gilmour
- Nora Aptula
- Ouarda Saib
- Paul Carmichael
- Predrag Kukic
- Ramya Rajagopal
- Regiane Sanches-Natumi
- Reiko Kiwamoto
- Richard Cubberley

- Richard Parry
- Roger van Egmond
- Sandrine Spriggs
- Sarah Hatherell
- Sharon Scott
- Sophie Cable
- Sophie Malcomber
- Stella Cochrane
- Steve Gutsell
- Sue Martin
- Tom Cull
- Wendy Simpson